

Sounds of Silence: Listening to the Universe with Gravitational Waves

Alessandra Buonanno

Max Planck Institute for Gravitational Physics

(Albert Einstein Institute)

Department of Physics, University of Maryland

Paco Yindurain Colloquium, Department of Physics, UAM, Madrid



- The theory of General Relativity by Albert Einstein, where space & time can fluctuate.
- All kinds of "pandemonium" in the Universe can ring space & time: how gravitational waves are produced.
- A campaign to record the sky began more than a half century ago: the quest for gravitational waves & the theoretical groundwork to predict their shapes.
- LIGO discoveries: A few billion hundred-million light years away black holes collided in darkness launching very loud gravitational-wave trains into the Universe.
- It is now possible not only to "see" but also to "hear" the Universe through gravitational waves: what we learned and what we will learn.

Newton's gravity versus Einstein's theory of General Relativity



Newton's gravity (1687)





///////////////////////////////////////	111111111111111111111111111111111111111
<i>~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ </i>	
<u></u>	
////////	

In Newton's gravity space and time are given a priori.

Time is absolute: it flows at the same rate everywhere, always.



General Relativity (1915)



Space-time is a dynamic and elastic entity both influencing and influenced by the distribution of mass-energy that it contains.

Einstein's geometric gravity.

Einstein's geometric gravity



No forces between bodies A and B: bodies move along straightest possible lines.



Gravity is the effect of "curvature" (or warp) in the geometry of space-time caused by the presence of any object with mass/energy. Bodies A and B no longer move along parallel lines. Why?

 Newton's gravity: there is a force between bodies A and B, thus they don't move along straightest possible lines.

R

• Einstein's geometric gravity: no force, bodies still move on straightest possible lines, but on a sphere not a plane!



Gravitational waves: the signature of dynamical spacetime

Geometry of space-time is dynamic, not fixed!

1916: Einstein predicted existence of gravitational waves

Distribution of mass deforms space-time in its neighborhood. This deformation propagates away in form of waves whose oscillations reflect temporal variation of matter distribution.

Ripples in fabric of space-time

Ripples in the water

Gravitational waves are very weak. We need large and "compact" bodies moving at high velocities! We need black holes ...





How gravitational waves are produced and typical strength

- GW sources are dominated by gravity
- GW are produced by variation in time of "quadrupole moment":





 The farther is the source, the weaker is the signal on Earth



source

• Typical **GW power**:



GW power can be similar or larger than the one of whole visible Universe!

• GW propagation (almost) unaffected by matter/energy: pristine probes

Black holes are ideal candidates. What are they?

A black hole is made of warped space and time. No matter!

Neither light nor anything else can escape black-hole "horizon".

black-hole mass: 10 Msun black-hole radius: 30 km!

Sun mass: 1 Msun =10³⁰ kg Sun radius: 700,000 km!







Black hole gravitational pull twists and bends geometry of space around the hole, in the same way a heavy ball placed on a sheet of rubber twists and bends the sheet's geometry. (a, b)

In the hole's vicinity no longer true that circumference = radius (2π) !



When falling into a black hole ...

When (stellar-mass) black holes collide, space-time rings ...

Credit: AEI/Milde Marketing



None of the energy emitted by the collision comes out as light. No telescope will ever see the events, but we can "hear" them ...

Black holes orbiting each other are the strongest sources of gravitational waves



Supergiant star--Cygnus X-I binary system

Black hole of 4 million solar masses in our galaxy's center!



Binary black hole

Gravitational waves do exist: we knew it from binary pulsars





credit: Kramer's group

Double-pulsar binary in close orbit with period of 2.45 hours.

The orbital period slowly decreases at just the rate predicted by general relativity.

Before LIGO detections, this was the strongest evidence for existence of gravitational radiation! Nobel prize to Hulse & Taylor in 1993



The Transient & Persistent Gravitational-Wave Sky





binary black hole

binary neutron star

• GWs from binaries are in band for tens of msec/mins in LIGO/Virgo, months/years in Einstein Telescope/LISA and are continuous signals in Pulsar Timing Arrays.



• Periodic GW signals from pulsars.



- GW-bursts from supernovae are in band for tens of msec.
- Stochastic GW backgrounds from early Universe.

• GW frequency: 10^{-9} - 10^3 Hz



LIGO



LISA



Pulsar Timing Array

International network of detectors to record the sky



LIGO Scientific Collaboration: about 800 members!





LIGO Scientific Collaboration & Virgo Collaboration: 1004 members!

Several decades of patient and steady work ... finally paid off!

Heinz Billing, and Garching group

Joe Weber, University of Maryland

First detailed

interferometer

study by Weiss

1967

First ideas

by Weber/

Forward

1960

2004

1994

2015

Crucial also theoretical groundwork to solve Einstein equations, and predict shape of gravitational waves from astrophysical sources.

1989

First detections of gravitational waves passing through Earth

LIGO in Washington (H1)

LIGO in Louisiana (L1)

On Sept 14, Dec 26, 2015 and Jan 4, 2017 GWs were detected!

 $\Delta L = L h \sim 10^{-16} \,\mathrm{cm}$

 $L = 4 \,\mathrm{km} \Rightarrow h \sim 10^{-21}$

LIGOs measures displacements of mirrors at about a ten-thousandth of a proton's diameter.

First LIGO Detection: GWI509I4

Gravitational waves carry fingerprints of the source that has generated them.

"Hearing" the gravitational wave or chirp

LIGO Scientific Collaboration

LIGO discovery made a big splash in the News

DIE

Descubierta la primera señal de ondas gravitacionales Un experimento en EE UU asegura ser el primero en confirmar

la existencia del "sonido del universo" predicho por Albert Einstein

NUÑO DOMÍNGUEZ

11 FEB 2016 - 19:24 CET

La última gran predicción de Albert Einstein sobre el universo se acaba de confirmar un siglo después: las <u>ondas gravitacionales</u> existen y un experimento en EE UU las ha detectado por primera vez.

8537 F

FREITAG, 12. FEBRUAR 2016

Beben im Universum

præse Smulation zeigt, wie zwei Schwarze Löcher miteinander verschmelzen und dabei Gravitationswellen abstrahlen. Das konnten sich Forscher zwar bisher vorstellen – aber nicht beweisen. Jetzt ist der Durchbruch gelungen, Wissenschaftler haben Gravitationswellen nach eigenen Angaben nachgewiesen. Die Astrophysiker vom Ligo-Observatorium in den USA präsentierten ihre nobelpreisverdächtige Entdeckung. Auch deutsche Forscher waren an der Arbeit beteiligt und belegten eine 100 Jahre alte These von Albert Einstein. Die Wellen sind Verzerrungen der Raumzeit und gehöre zu den Vorhersagen der Allgemeinen Relativitätsheorie. Die Erkenntnisse könnten helfen, die Rätsel um die Entstehung des Universums zu lüften. Kommentar Seite 3 und Seite 20

Chirp from black holes validates Einstein

Sound of cosmic collision offers direct evidence of gravitational waves

BY DENNIS OVERBYE

A team of physicists who can now count themselves as astronomers announced on Thursday that they had heard and recorded the sound of two black holes colliding a billion light-years away, a fleeting chirp that fulfilled the last prophecy of Einstein's general theory of relativity. That faint rising tone, physicists say, is the first direct evidence of gravitational waves, the ripples in the fabric of space-time that Einstein predicted a century ago. And it is a ringing (pun intended) confirmation of the nature of black holes, the bottomless gravitational pits from which not even light can escape, which were the most foreboding (and unwelcome) part of his theory.

More generally, it means that scientists have finally tapped into the deepest register of physical reality, where the weirdest and wildest implications of Einstein's universe become manifest. Conveyed by these gravitational

waves, an energy 50 times greater than

that of all the stars in the universe put together vibrated a pair of L-shaped antennas in Washington State and Louisiana known as LIGO on Sept. 14.

If replicated by future experiments, that simple chirp, which rose to the note of middle C before abruptly stopping, seems destined to take its place among the great sound bites of science, ranking with Alexander Graham Bell's "Mr. Watson — come here" and Sputnik's first beeps from orbit. "We are all over the moon and back."

said Gabriela González of Louisiana

State University, a spokeswoman for

BLACK HOLES, PAGE 6

An artist's rendering of two black holes that collided more than a billion years ago

The cosmic dance during the final 200 milliseconds

- Early inspiral: low velocity & weak gravity.
- Late inspiral/plunge: high velocity & strong gravity.
- Merger: black holes collide and form a new black hole!
- **Ringdown:** excitation of black-hole frequencies/spacetime vibrations.

Black holes collide at (almost) speed of light, like **fundamental particles**.

(Abbott et al. PRL 116 (2016) 061102)

Merger Ringdown

Inspiral

1.0

Strain (10⁻²¹)

Velocity (c)

How do we build waveform models?

- Einstein equations predict gravitational waves from colliding black holes, but it is difficult and time consuming to solve for them!
- We combine approximation methods to build highly-accurate waveform models (or templates) and use them to detect and infer black hole properties.

Analytical and numerical relativists at work

Model waveforms are built using analytical relativity (i.e., paper & pencil) and numerical relativity (i.e., supercomputers).

Working at the interface between analytical and numerical relativity, one tries to find a law or a pattern hidden in the data and formalize it with an equation or a model.

What is an approximate (analytic) model

- Impossible to find exact formula for orbit.
- Ellipse is no longer fixed and it also shrinks over time.

- Possible to find approximate, analytic model for the orbit.

Approximate analytic model for orbit and waveform

(AB & Damour Phys.Rev. D62 (2000) 064015)

• Curves computed solving equations and/or using analytic formulas that approximate Einstein equations.

Solving Two-Body Problem in General Relativity (including Radiation)

$$R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\mu\nu}R = \frac{8\pi G}{c^4}T_{\mu\nu}$$

- **GR** is non-linear theory. Complexity similar to QCD.
- Einstein's field equations can be solved:
 - approximately, but analytically (fast way)
 - exactly, but numerically on supercomputers (slow way)

m₁

- Analytical methods: post-Newtonian/post-Minkowskian expansions, gravitational self-force, effective-one-body theory
 - effective field-theory, dimensional regularization, etc.
 - diagrammatic approach to organize expansions

Assessing statistical confidence in LIGO detection

Matched filtering employed

(Abbott et al. Phys.Rev. X6 (2016) no.4, 041015)

 Confidence (False Alarm Probability) > 5-sigma (<1/200,000) that GW150914, GW151226, GW170104 were produced by gravitational waves instead of instrumental/environment noise.

Comparing model with exact solution of Einstein equations

(Ossokine, AB & SXS project)

- Solving Einstein equations for two colliding black holes on a supercomputer.
- Three weeks of computer time to produce this simulation!

(computer cluster @ AEI)

Waveform models very closely match the exact solutions from Einstein equations!

Properties of the binary black hole GWI509I5

GWI50914 took place 1.4 billion light-years away!

Binary black holes:

0.25

- $m_1 = 36$ solar mass
- $m_2 = 29$ solar mass
- intrinsic rotation= 67% of maximum value

 \cdot m = 62 solar mass

Final black hole:

Time / s

Sun Sirius ► Moon **Orion Nebula**

Small Magellanic Cloud

Energy radiated:

 $\sigma_{
m nois}$

 $\sigma_{
m noise}$

-3

-6

0.45

-3

-6

- 3 solar masses
- Power: ten times of all stars and galaxies in our Universe

Second gravitational wave detected by LIGOs

 GWI5I226: quieter than first event, 55 gravitational-wave cycles, duration of about 1.5 sec.

Numerical simulation of the binary black hole: GWI5I226

(visualization credit: Dietrich, Haas @ AEI)

 Solving Einstein equations for two colliding black holes on a supercomputer

(computer cluster @ AEI)

(Ossokine, AB & SXS project)

Three months of computer time to produce this simulation!

Third gravitational wave detected by LIGOs

(Abbott et al. PRL 118 (2017) 221101)

• GW170104: quieter than first event, 14 gravitational-wave cycles, duration of about 0.3 sec.

Black Holes Discovered through GWs during OI & O2 (so far)

(credit: Simonnet)

Some outstanding questions in astrophysics & fundamental physics

- What are the properties of dynamical spacetime (gravitational waves)?
- Is General Relativity still valid in the highly dynamical, strong-field regime?
- Are Nature's black holes the black holes in the theory of General Relativity? What are the astrophysical formation scenarios of binary black holes?
- How matter behaves under extreme density and pressure? Can dark matter make compact objects?
- What's the origin of the most energetic phenomena in our Universe? Rattles and shines: we will detect "sounds" and see "images".
- Which physical phenomena took place in the primordial dark age of the Universe?

Extreme gravity, dynamical spacetime: tests of General Relativity

Solar system:

Binary pulsars:

LIGO/Virgo: $\frac{c}{c} \ge 0.1$

- $\frac{v}{c} \sim 10^{-5} 10^{-4}$ $\frac{v}{c} \sim 10^{-3}$ $\frac{v}{c} \geq 0.1$
- Given current tight constraints on GR (e.g., Solar system, binary pulsars), can any GR deviation be observed with GW detectors?

First tests of General Relativity in dynamical, strong Field

• GWI509I4/GWI226I5/GWI70I04's rapidly varying orbital periods allow us to bound higher-order PN coefficients in gravitational phase.

 $\varphi($

$$\tilde{h}(f) = \mathcal{A}(f)e^{i\varphi(f)}$$

$$f) = \varphi_{\text{ref}} + 2\pi f t_{\text{ref}} + \varphi_{\text{Newt}} (Mf)^{-5/3} + \varphi_{0.5\text{PN}} (Mf)^{-4/3} + \varphi_{1\text{PN}} (Mf)^{-1} + \varphi_{1.5\text{PN}} (Mf)^{-2/3} + \cdots$$

(Arun et al. 06, Mishra et al. 10, Yunes & Pretorius 09, Li et al. 12)

- PN parameters describe: tails of radiation due to backscattering, spin-orbit and spin-spin couplings.
- PN parameters take different values in modified theories to GR.

Waveforms encode plethora of physical effects

Probing remnant: quasi normal modes (QNMs)

- Deformed black holes emits quasi-normal modes.
- Measuring at least two modes will be smoking gun that Nature's black holes are black holes of General Relativity.

 Multiple QNMs can be measured with future detectors, thus testing no-hair theorem and second-law black-hole mechanics (Israel 69, Carter 71; Hawking 71, Bardeen 73).

Remnant: black hole or exotic compact object?

• If remnant is horizonless, and/or horizon is replaced by "surface", new modes in the spectrum, and ringdown signal is modified: echoes signals

(Damour & Solodukhin 07, Cardoso, Franzin & Pani 16)

120

Probing new physics with GWs and neutron stars

(Baade & Zwicky 1934, Gamow 1937, Landau 1938, Oppenheimer & Volkoff 1939, Cameron 1959, Wheeler 1966)

Neutron Star:

- mass: I-3 Msun
- radius: 9-15 km
- core density > 10^{14} g/cm³

Inferring equation of state of dense matter

(Baade & Zwicky 1934, Gamow 1937, Landau 1938, Oppenheimer & Volkoff 1939, Cameron 1959, Wheeler 1966)

Neutron Star:

- mass: I-3 Msun
- radius: 9-15 km
- core density > 10^{14} g/cm³

• NS equation of state (EOS) affects gravitational waveform during late inspiral, merger and postmerger.

Extracting information on EOS from late inspiral

(Baade & Zwicky 1934, Gamow 1937, Landau 1938, Oppenheimer & Volkoff 1939, Cameron 1959, Wheeler 1966)

Neutron Star:

- mass: I-3 Msun
- radius: 9-15 km
- core density > 10^{14} g/cm³
- Tidal effects imprinted on gravitational waveform during inspiral through parameter λ.
- λ measures star's quadrupole deformation in response to companion perturbing tidal field:

$$\mathcal{Q}_{ij} = - \frac{\lambda}{\mathcal{E}_{ij}}$$

Gravitational waveform from a binary neutron star

• Synergy between analytical and numerical work is crucial again.

(Damour & Nagar 12; Bernuzzi et al. 15; Hinderer et al. 16, Steinhoff et al. 16)

Multi-messenger astrophysics with GW & EM

Multi-messenger astrophysics with GW & EM counterparts

Disclosing the origin of most energetic phenomena in universe

- Solving the enigma of shorthard GRBs progenitors.
- Understanding matter and geometry in extreme conditions of density, temperature, magnetic fields and relativistic motion.
- What's matter EOS at supra-nuclear density?

• r-processes (nucleosynthesis) in neutron-star mergers.

Cosmography: inference of cosmological parameters

• Wide-field galaxy surveys can provide (sky positions and) redshifts. (Schutz 1986)

- aLIGO/Adv.Virgo: measurement of Hubble constant H₀ with accuracy of 5% at 95% confidence after 40-50 GW observations with 3 detectors.
- Results will depend on knowledge of clusters' catalogues at redshifts larger than 1.

Cosmography with spacetime sirens: other considerations

 Mapping expansion rate of Universe on scales of hundreds Mpc will provide a completely independent estimate of Hubble parameter.

All kinds of turmoil in the Universe can ring space-time

Kepler's supernova SN 1604

 Core of massive star ceases to generate energy from nuclear fusion and undergoes sudden collapse forming a neutron star.

• GW signal is unshaped burst lasting for tenths of millisecond.

- Snapshot of the "very" early Universe.
- Stochastic GW background produced during rapid expansion of Universe after Big Bang.

- optical/X-ray image of the Crab Nebula
- Pulsars emit radio waves with extremely stable period.
- Typical "mountains" on a pulsar are I cm in height!
- GW signal is continuous and periodic.

Detecting gravitational waves in space: LISA

• Laser Interferometer Space Antenna (LISA): ESA mission for 2034 (2028?)

(Armano et al. PRL 116 (2016) 231101)

- LISA Pathfinder (technology mission) completed: extremely successful. LISA works!
- When galaxies collide, the supermassive black holes at their centers can interact and merge, emitting the strongest gravitational-wave signals.
- Ringing of space-time can be observed continuously over one-two years!

New Era of Precision Gravitational-Wave (astro)Physics

- GW observations by LIGO/Virgo opened a new era of scientific discovery.
- Gravitational interaction powers most luminous, spectacular objects and phenomena (GRBs, pulsars, supernovae, black-hole and neutron-star mergers, and evolution of early Universe).
- We will probe extreme gravity and astrophysics.
- We will solve outstanding questions in fundamental physics and cosmology.
- As for any new observational tool, gravitational (astro)physics will likely unveil phenomena and objects never imagined before.

